Chapter 12
A Chinese Model of Citizenship Education in Taiwan: Under the Influence of Globalization, Localization and Cross-Straitization

Chuing Prudence Chou

Abstract Although the trends of western democracy and the Confucian tradition have had a great impact on the formation of Taiwan's recent citizenship education policies, a third force, derived from the cross-strait relationships between Taiwan and China, has also played a critical role in shaping these policies. This chapter is an attempt to portray citizenship education in Taiwan as one of the manifestations of Chinese models from a multi-faceted perspective including Chinese cultural heritage, western democracy, and the cross-strait relationships with China. The author argues that, like many other countries in East Asia, citizenship education is a contested term in Taiwan, which fulfills the needs of social change, government policy and personal development. It has been found that the concept of national identity received very little attention in current Taiwan's citizenship education thanks to her ambiguous political status with China. Nevertheless, an image of 'being Taiwanese' is increasingly promoted and receives more and more attention in curriculum and instruction in Taiwan.

12.1 A Changing Regional Context in East Asia and Taiwan

East Asia has been undergoing rapid social and economic development and changes that transcend national borders. The region has become one of the foci of world attention because of its fast growing numbers of in-bound and out-bound students and the expansion of quality education services (UIS 2014). It has also been renowned for its culture of frugality, work ethic and family values with Confucius heritage. What's more important is that the region is in the process of rapid demographic transition, a reflection of its increased life expectancy, and a declining birth rate which has created an impending shortage of students at all levels of education

C.P. Chou (✉)
Department of Education, National Chengchi University, Taipei, Taiwan
e-mail: iaezcpc2007@gmail.com

(Chen 2001a). Nonetheless, East Asian economies continue to experience fundamental changes in a time of globalization. Despite its great cultural and geographical diversity, a process of regional economic cooperation and integration is emerging.

After 1949, China was later divided by the superpowers into two parts, Republic of China (Taiwan) and People's Republic of China (PRC) across the Taiwan Strait, as a result of its devastating civil war. Nevertheless, Taiwan's traditionally high educational zeal originated from the period of Japanese colonization and Chinese traditions. Coupled with its strong desire for modernization and prosperity, Taiwan has served as a reliable testimony of economic development in East Asia which shares the common traditions of Confucian educational philosophy and strong kinship within family ties. These are the foundations of the spirit of industry, peacefulness and order that contribute to high economic incentive, respect for the elderly and authority, and the harmony of society often witnessed in Taiwan (Hwang 2012; Chen 2001b).

Despite the diplomatic isolation, Taiwan is expected to promote and strengthen regional collaboration since her access to the World Trade Organization (WTO) in 2002 and the passing the Economic Cooperation Framework Agreement (ECFA) with China in 2010 (Fan 2014). Nevertheless, such regional integration and collaboration, as has taken place in East Asia, can also further weaken the ability of each government to promote its own public policies, especially in the making of citizenship that fulfills the needs of the people and encourages state cohesion (Kahler and Lake 2003).

12.1.1 The Impact of Democracy on Citizenship Education

The Chinese model of citizenship education in Taiwan can be described within the following themes: democracy, Confucian tradition and cross-straitization. Since the lifting of Martial Law in 1987, citizenship education in Taiwan has progressed alongside the evolution of a series of democratic movements, resulting in the phenomenal growth of political opposition parties and elections at all levels, non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and the rising impact of the internet social media in Taiwan. At the same time, East Asian coalitions that focus on human rights, and sustainable environment development have been formed. This trend has been accelerating since the economic and political rise of China and the democratization process in Taiwan whose educational development at all levels has accelerated over the last two decades (Chou and Ching 2012).

For example, in terms of the changing profile of textbooks, a study examined two sets of Taiwan's social studies textbooks for grade four, published from 1978 to 1995 (the first set between 1978 and 1989, the second between 1989 and 1995), to determine whether or not they reinforced the dominance of traditional Chinese cultural identity and neglected the diverse representation of different gender, cultural, ethnic groups and so forth (Su 2007). Also, the textbooks were analyzed to determine

whether their ideology had changed or not owing to the political and socioeconomic pressures Taiwan experienced after the democratization process of the late 1980s. The research findings indicated that both the historical interpretation and the ideology of a unified Chinese national identity were emphasized in both series of social studies textbooks before 1995. These two series often legitimated the notion that Taiwanese ancestors had migrated from mainland China, a notion that the Kuomintang (KMT) ruling party used in school textbooks as a means of asserting political legitimacy to convey special values, assumptions and principles that reflected the interests of the political authority (Apple 2004; Apple and Christian-Smith 1991). In line with this approach, many politically and culturally sensitive and controversial issues were removed from textbooks before the mid-1990s (Su 2007). Later, a nine-year integrated curriculum reform, started in 2001, attempted to increase the number of materials at every level of schooling containing local history, geography, culture and the arts. In addition, as more and more calls to respect social pluralism and the cultural diversity of all the ethnic groups in Taiwan have been heard, a variety of Taiwanese dialects (and possibly the inclusion of foreign parents' mother tongues in the future) have become part of the required courses at the primary level, in contrast to the former hegemony of Mandarin in the school curriculum before 1987. It is obvious that local and indigenous forms of knowledge and values are receiving greater recognition in the recent education reform (Yang 2001).

12.1.2 The Impact of Confucius Values on Citizenship Education

A society with strong social capital (such as educational support for offspring) is one in which social trust facilitates cooperation and networking for mutual benefit (Coleman 1990). The Chinese culture emphasizes family values and a sense of belongingness to one's clan. As a result, confusion may arise among ethics, law and the common good in Chinese societies, and family values may conflict with public interests. Unlike many developed countries whose education policy is very much influenced by economic and technological development, in the Taiwanese context, families are invited into decision-making processes; therefore, the process of forming a social consensus, including any forms of education policies for children, should take the family factor into consideration.

After comparing ten countries, including China, Egypt, Indonesia, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea, Soviet Union, Korea and Zaire, Thomas Murray (1992), proposed some items that appear to be necessary within the national development network, including moral/social values. Murray indicated that students should be educated adequately with values related to national development and cultural traditions. Drawing on Henry Giroux's ideas, we should integrate technology training in "civic courage" into the present education curriculum. In so doing, schools can equip students with passion, imagination and wisdom so they can be challenged

regardless of economic, political and social pressure (Giroux 1985). This is especially timely in conducting research on value clarification in the context of citizenship education. What we have at present in Taiwan is that, science and technology are taking over education to a great extent in the name of social modernization and national development (Elwyn 2000).

Taiwanese society has been very much influenced by Confucian values, such as political authoritarianism, the family system, academic examination systems, saving habits, local organization and family networks (Tu 1995). Education has always been regarded as a priority in Confucian culture, and the notion of studying implies hard work, effort, persistence, cultivation and rigidity, whereas playing games is considered idleness (Hwang 2012; Yao 2000; Zhou 2000). Consequently, Taiwanese society places much emphasis on educational credentials (such as a university degree) and the practice of taking examinations. As indicated earlier, after the national government withdrew from mainland China to Taiwan after 1949, the priority was to strengthen the Chinese identity and sovereignty of China over Taiwan. During that period, many aspects of Taiwanese culture and languages were banned, especially after the 228 (February 28) Incident in 1947, in which disputes arose between Chinese troops and local people.

According to Yang (2001) and Chou (2008), different periods of Taiwanese education reform seem to inevitably reflect an ideological conflict focused on the hope of regaining Taiwan's own national and cultural identity. The country has made a great effort to include a greater proportion of instructional content related to local history and geography along with local events in the recent curriculum reform since the mid-1990s. In the wake of the movement toward multiculturalism and respect for all of Taiwan's ethnic groups, schools have assumed authority over the curriculum, which prior to the 1990s was dominated by content related to the mainland. The trend toward localization has led to efforts to establish the Taiwanese identity and emphasize national prosperity as part of education reform measures, especially since the transfer of the political regime in 2000.

From 2000–2008, when the Democratic Progressive Party (DDP) administration was in power, President Chen, an advocate of Taiwanese independence, opposed the one-China policy that mainland China had proposed. During Chen's presidency, there was a lack of legislation that forged cross-strait academic exchanges and cooperation. President Chen, therefore, decided to halt cross-strait relations through the so-called de-Sinicization policy. First, in 2005, the civil exams were refocused on Taiwanese local history rather than Chinese history, and guidelines for the new high school curriculum were shifted from Chinese history to world history, rather than traditional Chinese history as domestic history. The proportion of Chinese classics in the literature curriculum was also decreased. The attempt to replace Chinese cultural bonds with the local identity of Taiwan was emphasized much more than before. The government highly promoted awareness of local culture, heritage and language in the form of a self-determination initiative.

With a more globalized economy and society, coupled with Taiwan's increasing dependence on China as a trading partner, the Taiwanese education system

has acted as a pendulum, swinging between globalization and localization in the last decade. As a small island, Taiwan cannot avoid participating in the processes of globalization, in terms of world trade and cultural exchange, occurring between different regions of the world. The localization of education has also made the Taiwanese more aware of their own cultural heritage and allowed younger generations to search for and construct their own identities often known as "Taiwanese." Therefore, the current idea of citizenship education reform is to integrate the trends of globalization and localization in order to create a clear understanding of the world and Taiwan itself (Chou and Ching 2012; Yang 2001).

12.2   The Impact of Cross-Straitization on Citizenship Education

As indicated earlier, though the influence of democracy and the Confucius heritage has a great impact on Taiwan's citizenship education policies, a third force, stemming from the cross-strait relationship with mainland China, has also played a critical role in shaping Taiwan's citizenship education policies (Chou and Ching 2012).

The year 1987 played a significant historical role in cross-strait relations because, not only did Taiwan lift martial law in that year, but it also granted permission for veterans drafted by the armed forces from China during the civil war, to visit their families in China. Hence, the cross-strait relationship entered a new era of communication.

Concerning student exchange programs, in November 1987, Taiwan loosened its policy over Chinese visitors, especially for those overseas and distinguished professionals who wished to visit Taiwan. Since 1990, Taiwan has granted more access to Chinese citizens who have made contributions in fields such as academia, culture, sports, mass media communications and the arts. Moreover, in 1993, Chinese professionals and students were given the additional opportunity to visit Taiwan for educational and cultural purposes. According to statistics, 18,907 Chinese students visited Taiwan officially between January 1, 2002, and October 31, 2009. Though statistics are lacking about the reverse visits, it was expected that many more Taiwan students would be visiting China during their summer and winter vacations. With this, we can see that there is evidence of significantly skewed data from Taiwan's side compared to those of its counterpart in China. Furthermore, Chinese graduate students pursuing research who were sponsored by Taiwan were granted a period of from 1 month to a year to live in the country. The annual quota was 1000 students per year in the past. Since 1996, Chinese graduate students have been able to apply for a full scholarship of up to 3 months to conduct research related to their theses at local universities in Taiwan. Beyond that, more than 235,591 Chinese professionals in the cultural and educational sectors, out of a total of 2,712,572 Chinese visitors in 20 categories, traveled to Taiwan during the 1988–2009.

12.2.1   Development of Citizenship Education in Taiwan

As Gilbert (1996) indicated citizenship is often regarded as a contested form. Some defined it as an entity to a nation state, which requires her people giving allegiance and loyalty. The state, in return, provides her citizens with legal and political rights (Howard 2006). Others regard it as individual rights or a sense of shared loyalty over national cohesion. Citizen participation in government can also be regarded as a priority among other civil obligations. As to this aspect, Mutch (2004) conducted a survey of educational policymakers in the Asia-Pacific region with a framework programmed by the OECD/CERI1 (2001). The project attempted to investigate the nature of citizenship characteristics in educational policy in New Zealand, Australia, Hong Kong and Taiwan. The research findings indicated that most education policymakers in the 1980s and 1990s in Taiwan were convinced that schools would fulfill their mission as learning organizations, and the citizenship education curriculum was expected to focus on civic knowledge, moral behavior and civic values with an emphasis on social cohesion, national identity, self-cultivation and democratic values (Pederson and Cogan 2002). Nevertheless, after the implementation of the new Nine-Year Integrated Curriculum Plan in 2001, an interdisciplinary approach was initiated between the seven subject areas from years 1–9, including languages, mathematics, social studies, nature and technology, arts and humanities, health and physical education and general activities. In contrast, the old civic education curriculum emphasized more knowledge transmission at the expense of student participatory citizenship and critical thinking. The new curriculum plan, however, was designed to improve citizenship through a process of inquiry and discussion over local culture and social issues, with the hope of enhancing value clarification when students faced the controversial issues such as 'Taiwanese national identity', 'Chinese nationalism' and 'indigenous cultural awareness'. Nonetheless, the policymaking process of this new curriculum was considered a top-down one instead of a grassroots approach. The study concludes by highlighting the importance of the contextual nature of any curriculum development in citizenship education, including a better understanding and inclusion of one's historical, political and social contexts in dealing with policymaking (Mutch 2004; Lui and Doong 2002).

It is worth noting, when the seventh National Education Conference was held in 1994, an atmosphere of change was developing in Taiwanese society, due to the liberalization of both the political and the economic environment. The whole society at the time was demanding the deregulation, democratization, liberalization and diversification of education. Almost two decades later, the status of the education system both in Taiwan and abroad has changed in many ways. A globalized society has arrived earlier than expected due to the rapid development of information technology. In Taiwan, apart from the typical changes resulting from globalization, Taiwanese society has faced additional challenges in the last decade, such as: demographic changes (a drastic declining

birthrate, an emerging aging population and a diverse population composition from international marriage), the migration of industries to offshore locations (China, in particular), a rising unemployment rate (especially among the youth), an excess number of universities and colleges awaiting consolidation or closure, an urgent need for transnational personnel following the upgrade and transformation of industry, a continuing debate over national identity and ideology in education (Taiwanese or Chinese), issues related to educational opportunities and cultural inheritance for social vulnerable groups, the unequal distribution of educational resources,, and an imbalance in the supply and demand of qualified school teachers (Chou and Ching 2012).

In the effort to respond to Taiwanese society's eagerness for educational reform and to implement the government's innovations in education policy, the Ministry of Education (MOE) (2010a) convened the eighth National Education Conference in August 2010 to construct Taiwan's educational blueprint for the next 10 years (2011–2021). In 2011, as Taiwan (the Republic of China) celebrated its 100th Anniversary, the 9-year universal education has existed for more than 40 years, the enrollment rate of school-aged children is above 99.9 %, the postsecondary education opportunity rate has reached 100 %, higher education's expansion has received popular approval, the illiteracy rate of students over 15 years old has dropped to 2.09 %, and the education budget-to-GDP ratio reached 6.51 % in 2010 (MOE 2010a).

Education policy aims to no longer focus on quantity but quality in Taiwan. While Europe and the United States have suffered from the global financial downturn since 2008, Taiwan, which regards education as the foundation of the country, has announced a substantial increase in its education budget, revealed a new vision for national infrastructure called the 'Golden Decade' and formulated six directions for development in the future, namely, innovation, culture, environmental protection, constitutional politics, welfare and peace (Ma 2011). Thus, the eighth National Education Conference focused on six topics in education: 'life and character education'; 'education for human rights, the rule of law and gender equity'; 'media literacy and information technology'; 'ecological and environmental education'; 'security and disaster prevention education'; 'art and aesthetic education'; and 'implementation of the sustainable campus plan' (Kuo 2010). In addition, a series of infrastructural improvements was also under review, including the new 12-year basic education program which revises its new curriculum guidelines with an emphasis on the development of individual talents and interests with appropriate teacher training programs, civil resources promotion and so forth. Thus, the promotion of citizenship education is expected to go beyond traditional classroom education with a different account of integration and combination of in-school and extracurricular learning activities, as well as various channels in daily-life practices. Examples include how to equip young children with skills such as how to follow traffic regulations, how to volunteer in the community, and how to serve in the student association, etc. (Chou and Ching 2012).

12.2.2 The Upcoming Challenges

The general public in Taiwan has many concerns related to education. Heavy pressure associated with high school and university entrance exams still exists on school campuses, and students suffer from the double pressure of academics and finances (for supplementary education). With gang members invading campuses, incidents of bullying, drug abuse and the violation of rules are becoming increasingly frequent. Though Taiwan's students at the primary and secondary levels continually win prizes in international academic competitions, including the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA), the Third International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS) and International Mathematical Olympiad, most students study without much curiosity and show little interest in outside reading (Chou 2008a). In addition, Taiwan has also encountered the following social changes that create a great deal of challenges on citizenship education (MOE 2010b).

12.2.3 The Rise of the Internet Age

With the rapid development of the Internet, it has become cheaper and more convenient to get information. The Internet has not only expanded people's visions but also altered the traditional school system. The rise of the Internet offers adults a great opportunity to continue to study throughout their lives, while, on the other hand, it helps schools to offer courses designed according to individualized requirements and multiple intelligences. Therefore, with this rapid transition to a global society, the Internet has become an important way to reinforce e-learning and connections of many kinds, such as those social and informative in nature, improve information flow and promote social agendas among students.

The arrival of the virtual world and cloud computing has not only provided greater access to information via the Internet but has also resulted in various problems, such as the online subculture, that has appeared among teenagers and that deviates from the mainstream. Moreover, the issue of Internet addiction, which is a serious concern in Taiwan, has divided parents, teachers and students. In particular, moral education is more important than ever. The challenging question of how to educate the next generation in such a complex environment deserves more creative and unconventional policies in the field of education.

12.2.4 The Emergence of a Low Birthrate and an Aging Society

In recent years, Taiwan's population structure has changed into a heterogeneous one with a low birthrate and an aging population, factors that will eventually have a great impact on the country's economic, social and educational development. The

birth rate has dropped, from 410,000 newborn babies in 1981, to 270,000 in 1998, to 191,000 in 2009, which is the lowest level in the last 50 years. Many schools (especially in the remote areas) have found themselves confronted with serious problems related to the need to lay off teachers and shut down schools. Universities will face a series of institutional closures or mergers in 2016, when the first wave of members of a declining population reaches college age (Hu 2010). In addition, among this younger generation, according to statistics from the MOE (2010a), children of foreign nationality and of parents of whom one is Chinese account for nearly 10 % of the total student population and 3 % at the lower secondary level in Taiwan (MOE 2011).

Furthermore, in 1993, the population ratio of the elderly, those over 65 years old, surpassed 7 % for the first time. Since then, the percentage has grown gradually each year, and it will reach 20 % in 2026. It is clear that the aging of the population will be related to a rising dependency rate and will place an immense burden on society. Under such circumstances, the Taiwan school system and its educational resources will need to be adjusted and reconfigured so that they are more suited to the changing society.

12.2.5   Impact of the M-Shape of Education Development

With the transition of Taiwan's domestic economic and social structure, phenomena such as an uneven distribution of regional resources, varied teaching quality in schools and differences in students' abilities to learn in urban versus rural areas have been found to exist in the education sector, too. Moreover, according to the Japanese writer Ōmae Ken'ichi (1990), those vulnerable social groups that are influenced by economic factors or family status (e.g., those with single parents or only grandparents) have become important reasons for the M-shape of educational distribution. Children who have grown up in such environments are usually subjected to poverty and crime due to the lack of cultural capital and role models (Katz et al. 2007). As the family structure declines and is transformed in Taiwan, an integrated task force will be needed that can collaborate with various government departments, such as those in education, social welfare, healthcare and the police, to provide support to these at-risk children.

12.2.6   Challenges Related to Climate Change and Environmental Sustainability

Over the last 10 years, Taiwan has been hit by a series of natural disasters, such as the devastating 921 Earthquake of 2000, an unexpected Morakot Typhoon, the 88 Wind Hazard in 2009 and a serious drought island-wide in 2015, which resulted in unprecedented consequences to educational facilities, especially in the

disadvantaged regions (MOE 2009). According to 'World Bank Natural Disaster Hotspots—A Global Risk Analysis' (Arnold et al. 2005), Taiwan is one of the areas of the world where natural disasters occur most frequently. Thus, more educational awareness is required to enhance citizens' understanding of global climate change and the balanced coexistence of economic development and environmental protection.

In particular, sustainable development is the focus of the United Nation's plans for (UN) educational development in 2005–2014 (United Nations 2011). Therefore, authorities at all school levels have to consider how to integrate the concept of 'sustainable development' into the existing school curriculum and instruction as one of the core competencies to raise students' level of literacy in this area.

12.2.7   National Identity Conflict Among Students

There have also been instances of a struggle to define its identity that has occurred. In an International Civic and Citizenship Education Study (ICCS) study of civic and citizenship education in 37 countries around the world in 2009, results for Taiwan (referred as Chinese Taipei) showed that Taiwanese teenagers (14 years old) scored much lower than the average in regard to "trust in national government, political parties, media, schools, and people in general" (Schulz et al. 2010a). Moreover, Taiwan (referred as Chinese Taipei) participated in an IEA study of civic and citizenship education (Schulz et al. 2010b) with 37 other countries, and the results showed the overall scores of Taiwanese 14-year-olds ranked fourth overall. However, on several questions regarding 'trust in national government, political parties, media, schools and people in general' the participants scored much lower than the average. In particular, almost three-quarters of Taiwanese secondary students stated that they did not trust their political system overall' as (Schulz et al. 2010a, b). Why did this happen among Taiwanese teenagers? Clearly, there is a feeling of distrust among fourteen-year-olds of political institutions in Taiwan. These relatively low scores suggest that citizenship education among Taiwanese teenagers has room for improvement.

However, at the same time that high-level cross-strait relations and economic cooperation have developed to an unprecedented degree due in the past 6 years, cultural and educational exchanges have also increased. Recent changes in the political atmosphere between Taiwan and mainland China have led to the lifting of the long-time ban on recruiting Chinese students to study in Taiwan. Since September 2011, an increasing number of Chinese students have been admitted to Taiwanese universities as degree-seekers. Meanwhile, short-term exchange programs between the two sides number in the thousands. Throughout this process, the multifaceted and dynamic way in which traditional Chinese culture and intensifying cross-strait interactions are shaping national identity is giving rise to great uncertainty about the future in Taiwan.

Research indicates that people in mainland China and Taiwan have, throughout time, been able to justify their national identities in a subtle way, a phenomenon that remains evident today (Hao 2010). Education plays a major role in shaping national identity in Taiwan, and with the ongoing cross-strait cultural and education exchanges in higher education, this has become more legitimate than before. Higher education institutes (HEIs) in Taiwan are expected to assume a key role which will eventually lead to constant, close communication and exchanges between faculty members, students and others in China and Taiwan (Chou and Ching 2015). In addition, China's rise will most likely have an impact on re-shaping Taiwanese identities as well as leading to the emergence of a new profile for Chinese people. Whether or not these new transformations will take place depend on the future of cross-strait relations.

12.3   Conclusion

The inevitable growth of concern over citizenship education throughout Taiwan has become a major topic of discussion over the last two decades. The trend of globalization and localization has affected many educational sectors in East Asia. Taiwan's efforts to globalize and democratize its education system while preserving its Chinese cultural heritage with local identity has led to new dilemmas for citizenship education in terms of undeclared or even uncertain status of her national identity. Among the most significant changes is the increasing number of educational and cultural exchanges with mainland China which is unprecedented since 1949. These multifaceted forces of the Confucius tradition, democratization, and cross-straitization have shaped a unique Chinese model in Taiwan's contemporary citizenship education, which has distinguished itself from her other Chinese counterparts, namely, China, Hong Kong and Macau.

For centuries, Taiwan has been faced with identity conflicts. Whether under Japanese colonial rule (1895–1945), during the subsequent period of re-Sinicization after World War II (1949–1987), or throughout the de-Sinicization era under the Lee Teng-hui and Chen Shui-bian presidencies (1988–2008), the Taiwanese people have been subjected to a complex interplay of political and socio-cultural forces shaping their identities (Wilde 2005). Today, the constant dilemma in Taiwan over national identity continues to influence her citizenship education at all levels (Chou 2014). Despite the continuing cross-strait exchanges over the last two decades, Taiwan's general public and college students still remain suspicious about China's potential attempt for reunification.

In sum, it is worthwhile to see how cultural heritage, western democracy, and the cross-strait relationships with China will continue to shape and transform citizenship education in Taiwan, whose national identity still receives no consensus.

References

Apple, M. W. (2004). *Ideology and curriculum*. New York: Falmer Press.

Apple, M. W., & Christian-Smith, L. (1991). *The politics of the textbooks*. New York: Routledge/Chapman and Hall.

Arnold, M., Dilley, M., Deichmann, U., Chen, R. S., & Lerner-Lam, A. L. (2005). *Natural disaster hotspots: A global risk analysis*. Washington, DC: World Bank.

Chen, J. C. (2001a). The moral education under the trend of biotech development. In *National Taiwan Normal University, international conference of the citizen quality and teachers training*, Taipei.

Chen, J. C. (2001b), Being a mentor—The self-identity of primary school teachers. *Primary Education Journal of NTNU, 52*(3), 25–28.

Chou, C. P. (2008). The impact of neo-liberalism on Taiwanese higher education. *International Perspectives on Education and Society, 9*, 297–311.

Chou, Y. W. (2011, January 14). The myths of 12-year compulsory education, *Taiwan Today*. http://taiwantoday.tw/ct.asp?xItem=144212&ctNode=413. Accessed 21 Mar 2014.

Chou, C. P. (2014). Education in Taiwan: Taiwan's colleges and universities. *Taiwan-U.S. Quarterly Analysis*, No. 16.

Chou, C. P., & Ching, G. (2012). *Taiwan education at the cross-road: When globalization meets localization*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Chou, C. P., & Ching, G. (2015). Cross-straitization of higher education: Voices of the Mainland Chinese students studying in Taiwan. *International Journal of Information and Education Technology, 5*(2), 89–94.

Coleman, J. S. (1990). *Equality and achievement in education* (Social inequality series). Boulder: Westview.

Elwyn, T. (2000). Researching values in cross-culture contexts. In R. Gardner, J. Cairns, & D. Lawton (Eds.), *Education for value: Morals, ethics and citizenship in contemporary teaching* (pp. 257–265). London: Kogan.

Fan, JoAnn. (2014). *Congressional testimony: Cross-strait economic and political issues*. Available online at: http://www.brookings.edu/research/testimony/2014/06/05-cross-strait-economic-issues-fan

Gilbert, R. (1996). *Studying society and environment: A handbook for teachers*. Melbourne: Macmillan Education.

Giroux, H. A. (1985). *Theory and resistance in education*. New York: Bergin & Garvey.

Hao, Z. (2010). *Whiter Taiwan and Mainland China: National identity, the state, and intellectuals*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press.

Howard, M. M. (2006). Comparative citizenship: An agenda for cross-national research. *Perspectives on Politics, 4*(3), 443–455. Available online at: http://www18.georgetown.edu/data/people/mmh/publication-12332.pdf

Hu, C.-H. (2010, December 12). Consolidation of Universities will reach a peak in 5 years. *Liberty Times*, 12 December.

Hwang, K. K. (2012). *Foundations of Chinese psychology: Confucian social relations*. New York: Springer.

Kahler, M., & Lake, D. A. (2003). *Globalization and governance: Definition, variation, and explanation.* Available online at: www.unc.edu/depts/europe/conferences/…/kahler_lake.doc

Katz, I., Corlyon, J., La Placa, V., & Hunter, S. (2007). *The relationship between parenting and poverty*. http://www.jrf.org.uk/sites/files/jrf/parenting-poverty.pdf

Kuo, W. F. (2010, March 1). A century of educational reform. *Taiwan Review*. http://taiwanreview.nat.gov.tw/ct.asp?xItem=146617&CtNode=1337. Accessed 21 Mar 2014.

Lui, J. M., & Doong, S. (2002). Civic education reform in Taiwan: Directions, controversies and challenges. *Pacific-Asian Education, 14*(1), 26–37.

Ma, Y.-j. (2011, January 1). *Building up Taiwan, Invigorating Chinese heritage*, Taipei: Office of the President, Republic of China (Taiwan). http://english.president.gov.tw/Default.aspx?tabid=491&itemid=23186&rmid=2355. Accessed 21 Mar 2014.

MOE (Ministry of Education, Republic of China). (2009). *MOE to subsidize more than 5,000 NT dollars to students injured during Typhoon Morakot*. Taipei: MOE. http://english.moe.gov.tw/ct.asp?xItem=11540&ctNode=517&mp=1. Accessed 21 Mar 2014.

MOE (Ministry of Education, Republic of China). (2010a). 2010–2011 *Education in Taiwan*. Taipei: MOE. https://stats.moe.gov.tw/files/ebook/Education_in_Taiwan/2010-2011_Education_in_Taiwan.pdf. Accessed 21 Mar 2014.

MOE (Ministry of Education, Republic of China). (2010b). *Report addressed at the Legislation Yuan*. Taipei: MOE.

MOE (Ministry of Education, Republic of China). (2011). *Statistics of foreign spouses offspring in compulsory education*. Taipei: MOE.

Murray, T. (Ed.). (1992). *Education's role in National development plans: Ten country cases*. New York: Greenwood.

Mutch, C. (2004). Educational policy and notions of citizenship in four Asia-Pacific societies. *Asia Pacific Education Review, 5*(2), 178–187.

OECD/CERI. (2001). *What schools for the future?* Paris: OECD.

Ōmae, K.'i. (1990). *The borderless world: Power and strategy in the interlinked world economy*. New York: Harper Business.

Pederson, P., & Cogan, J. (2002). Civics education, pedagogy, and assessment in the Pacific Rim: Six cases. *The International Journal of Social Education, 17*(1), 16–30.

Schulz, W., Ainley, J., Fraillon, J., Kerr, D., & Losito, B. (2010a). *Initial findings from the IEA international civic and citizenship education study*. Amsterdam: International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement. http://iccs.acer.edu.au/uploads/File/Reports/ICCS_10_Initial_Findings.pdf. Accessed 21 Mar 2014.

Schulz, W., Ainley, J., Fraillon, J., Kerr, D., & Losito, B. (2010b). *ICCS 2009 international report: Civic knowledge, attitudes and engagement among lower secondary school students in thirty-eight countries*. Amsterdam: International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA).

Su, Y.-c. (2007). Ideological representations of Taiwan's history: An analysis of elementary social studies textbooks, 1978–1995. *Curriculum Inquiry, 37*(3), 205–237.

Tu, W.-M. (1995). The mirror of modernity and spiritual resources for the global community. *Sophia, 34*(1), 79–91.

UNESCO-UIS. (2014). *Higher education in Asia: Expanding out, expanding up*. Available online at: http://www.uis.unesco.org/Library/Documents/higher-education-asia-graduate-university--research-2014-en.pdf

United Nations. (2011). *Education for Sustainable Development (ESD)*. New York: United Nations.

Wilde, S. (2005). *Political and citizenship education*. Oxford: Symposium Books.

Yang, S.-K. (2001). *Dilemmas of education reform in Taiwan: Internationalization or localization?* Annual meeting of the Comparative and International Education Society, Washington, DC, 14–17 March.

Yao, X.-Z. (2000). *An introduction to Confucianism*. Cambridge: Cambridge Press.

Zhou, Y.-W. (2000). Confucianism and competition of education. In S. W. Yang (Ed.), *International conference for a study on the competition of education in Confucian Asia for Center for Educational Research* (pp. 204–221). Taipei: National Taiwan University.